



# CORDELL BANK NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY SANCTUARY ADVISORY COUNCIL

---

## MEETING MINUTES

November 13, 2014

9:30 AM

Point Blue Conservation Science, Palomarin Room, Petaluma, CA

Note: The following meeting notes are an account of discussions at the meeting of the Sanctuary Advisory Council for Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary (CBNMS). The council is an advisory body to the sanctuary superintendent. The opinions and findings of this publication do not necessarily reflect the position of CBNMS and the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA).

### **Call to Order/Welcome/Roll Call** (George Clyde)

Advisory Council Chair George Clyde called the meeting to order at 9:30 AM.

George welcomed everyone; advisory council coordinator Lilli Ferguson then called roll.

### Members and Alternates Present:

George Clyde (Chair; Community-at-Large - Marin)  
Mike Cummings (Community-at-Large - Marin Alt.)  
Bill Wolpert (Community-at-Large - Sonoma)  
Sarah Hameed (Community-at-Large - Sonoma Alt.)  
Leslie Adler-Ivanbrook (Education)  
Rachel Bergren (Education Alt.)  
Kevin Krick (Vice Chair; Maritime Activities)  
John Berge (Maritime Activities Alt.)  
Jaime Jahncke (Research)  
Pete Adams (Research Alt.)

### Agency Representatives and Alternates Present:

Dayna Matthews, NOAA Fisheries  
LTJG Amanda Faulkner, U.S. Coast Guard (Alt.)

Members of the CBNMS staff were also present:

Dan Howard (Sanctuary Superintendent)  
Michael Carver (Deputy Superintendent)  
Lilli Ferguson (Resource Protection Specialist and advisory council coordinator)  
Dani Lipski (Research Coordinator)  
Jennifer Stock (Education and Outreach Coordinator)

### **Review and Approve Agenda** (George)

The agenda was reviewed and unanimously approved by the advisory council with two changes: Dan Howard would give the Cordell Marine Sanctuary Foundation (CMSF) report on behalf of Tom Lambert, who would not be at the meeting, and lunch might be shortened.

## **Review and Approve August Meeting Minutes (George)**

The August 21, 2014 meeting minutes were reviewed and unanimously approved by the advisory council.

## **Sanctuary Superintendent's Report (Dan)**

Changes in advisory council membership:

George was reappointed to a term as the member for the Community-At-Large – Marin seat and Jaime Jahncke was reappointed to a term as the member for the Research seat. For the agency seats, Dayna Matthews was now the representative for the NOAA Fisheries seat, with Joe Scarpa as his alternate. LTJG Amanda Faulkner was now the alternate for the United States Coast Guard seat. They were welcomed.

Proposed expansion of CBNMS update:

- Dan said a draft response to comments on the draft environmental impact statement and proposed rule had been completed at the staff level and sent for review by NOAA and Department of Commerce offices at headquarters. The final management plans were also drafted and undergoing review, as was the final rule.
- The California Coastal Commission would be reviewing NOAA's proposed action at its December meeting. NOAA was shooting for release of the final environmental impact statement and final management plans in December, with the final rule no less than 30 days later. Once the final rule was published, the Governor would review the Gulf of the Farallones National Marine Sanctuary (GFNMS) portion; none of the CBNMS expansion area would be in state waters so its regulations would not require Governor review. There also would be a period of 45 days of continuous session of Congress, with the final rule planned to go into effect at the end of that period.
- NOAA had heard people during the public comment period, and intended to make changes in the final rule. In the CBNMS portion of the final rule, they planned to remove the authorization authority language and revisit the issue after CBNMS expanded. He reviewed that this authority could have allowed for NOAA approval of certain activities otherwise prohibited by CBNMS regulations--if already permitted by another federal, state or local agency and the proposal went through ONMS review and everything was in order. An example could be an Army Corps of Engineers permit for dredge disposal. A number of people and groups had expressed concern about the authority. NOAA position was it was a good tool for streamlining the permitting process, and planned to come back around to the issue, after the expansion was in effect.
- In answer to a question about the non-native species introduction rule [for GFNMS and Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary], Dan said that rule was on a separate track, and could be released in December.
- There was a question if the CBNMS part of the rule could proceed independently, if something disrupted the approval process for the GFNMS part of the expansion. These parts would probably stay together, as the EIS treated the issues jointly, and the issues might be difficult to separate.
- Regarding the possible involvement of Congress and the Office of Management and Budget, other than the 45 continuous days of session of Congress, which allowed for review, no other involvement was planned at this point.

#### CBNMS office move:

The date for moving the CBNMS staff into the new CBNMS offices was set for January 5, with the new furniture, remaining carpet, etc. to be installed prior to that.

#### NOAA Habitat Blueprint:

- Regarding the blueprint for the Russian River, there were five primary projects. Dan's work was on the estuary project, for which Tim Doherty was now lead. Some things to be worked on: flow rates, sea level rise scenarios, atmospheric rivers, frost data for grape growers, helping with response to storm and flooding events, and funding for a Point Blue component of the estuary project.
- Dan said he would check on the date of the annual Christmas party at Point Reyes National Seashore and would get information about it to the advisory council.
- The San Francisco International Film Festival is moving back to the Cowell Theater in 2015. They are recruiting middle schools and high schools for participating in free educational portions of the festival. He asked for the advisory council's help if they knew of a few new schools who might participate, and said he would have Lilli send out a flyer on this.

#### CMSF activities:

- The CMSF website had been updated and had a new look; an announcement would be coming to the advisory council soon about this.
- CMSF and the Farallones Marine Sanctuary Foundation folks were working with the staff and others on what a sanctuary expansion celebration might look like. Perhaps a celebration with the community might be held in late April south of Gualala.
- The CMSF was working with CBNMS on the development of an ocean interpretive center at the Point Reyes lighthouse, in conjunction with Point Reyes National Seashore and GFNMS. He mentioned Jennifer Stock had a vision of having a bronze whale tail sculpture or something similar in front. The hope was to work with CMSF and the Point Reyes National Seashore Association to fundraise for this element.
- Tom is stepping down as of May 1. Dan was investigating the possibility of Tom staying on in an emeritus status.

#### **Advisory Council Business (Lilli)**

Lilli announced that the upcoming round of seeking applicants for appointment to three positions: Community-At-Large – Marin County (alternate), Education (member), and Research (alternate). Incumbents could reapply; Pete Adams decided not to reapply for the Research (alternate) position. She said she would send the advisory council an email with application information after it on the CBNMS website. Application period: November 14 to December 31.

Regarding renewal of the CBNMS Advisory Council Charter, it had been submitted for signature by Dan Basta, Office of National Marine Sanctuaries (ONMS) Director. She provided a brief overview of the few charter changes made since her report to the advisory council in August.

## **CBNMS Education, Resource Protection, and Research Reports (Jennifer Stock, Michael Carver, and Dani Lipki)**

### **Education:**

- Jennifer reviewed a mandate to do outreach for all national marine sanctuaries, with a mission to inspire ocean and climate literacy and conservation, connecting back to the individual sites. CBNMS education and outreach activities include a radio show, presentations, Point Reyes National Seashore docent training, social media, a list serv, special events, teacher workshops, permanent exhibits and signs, and traveling exhibits.
- One of the new permanent exhibits is at the Oakland Museum and another one is being built at the Point Reyes lighthouse, in partnership with National Parks, national marine sanctuaries, GFNMS, and others. The new ocean interpretive center service would aim to enable visitors to have a greater appreciation and awareness of the area's ocean resources. She went over some of the planned main messages and themes, which stemmed from a needs assessment and workshop, and showed sketches of construction and potential exhibits. The seashore staff was managing the funds (with funding contributed by CBNMS; to be spent by September 2015). Next steps for the exhibit include hiring a contract project manager, determining final content and layout, and exhibit fabrication. A fundraising campaign would probably be launched for purchasing the whale tail sculpture. She explained "interpretation" is the term used for making connections for people, in this case with the ocean. The exhibit content was not worked out yet, but intend to keep it low tech due to salt, the space available, etc.
- The traveling CBNMS photo exhibit was at the Petaluma Library, and she mentioned other places it would go in 2015. An intern is helping curate the photo exhibit.
- A NatureBridge teacher workshop is being organized for June on coastal science, with funding from the NOAA Office of Education and working with the San Francisco Bay National Estuarine Research Reserve.
- ONMS has a social media campaign, Earth is Blue, and Jennifer encouraged people to share photos posted on the ONMS web page, or participate with their own photos.

### **Resource Protection:**

- Michael Carver reviewed Whale Alert, which is available on the Apple store, and would also be on the Android store in early 2015. A primary goal is reducing lethal ship strikes of whales. He reviewed its main features, including reporting whale sightings. He is writing a two year plan. He thanked Jaime for a website that provides whale locations. Data from the Applied California Current Ecosystem Studies (ACCESS), Spotter Pro and Whale Alert are all in the database. Whale sighting data can be entered into a cell phone, which will transmit it either right away or once it has a signal. This application would be used most by those frequently on the water. For people who wish to distribute a brochure, a PDF is on the West Coast Whale Alert web site.
- He also reviewed efforts on law enforcement and emergency response. Dayna and Joe are the primary Office of Law Enforcement staff working on CBNMS law enforcement issues. The West Coast region is tracking sanctuary regulation violations, including anecdotal stories; people are encouraged to let Michael know if they hear of any CBNMS-related violations. New technology may help augment law enforcement efforts, such as use of flying Puma drones. This will depend in part on Federal Aviation Administration regulations.
- He noted Lilli's resource protection duties are working on the proposed expansion of CBNMS and GFNMS, and attending local Harbor Safety Committee and Area Committee meetings.

Research:

- Danielle Lipski showed photographs from the dives made by the Bay Area Underwater Explorers (BAUE) in October 2014. They had a sanctuary permit for a pilot project to do some data collection, via laying out a reference site with a transect, then taking photos along the transect for yearly comparisons. They attached permanent markers, but had to zigzag as there was no level area for a straight line. There were some difficulties in taking the photographs due to current, so perhaps video might work better in the future.
- Since the remotely operated vehicle (ROV) cruises, Dani mentioned a press release came out focused on a new coral species, collected and identified by Gary Williams of CalAcademy. Another notable finding was a cat nurse shark area. Both of these discoveries were in the proposed expansion area for GFNMS scientists call “the football.” The cruise data is being processed and analyzed.

### **Modern Processes Observed in Submarine Canyons along the California Margin: Lessons Relevant to Bodega Canyon and Cordell Bank (Charlie Paull, Ph.D.)**

Charlie Paull, Ph.D., a marine geologist with the Monterey Bay Aquarium Research Institute, has spent a good part of his career working in submarine canyons. He noted Bodega Canyon was largely unstudied, so he would talk about it in terms of lessons learned from other submarine canyons. The NOAA Office of Ocean Exploration and Research had collected some data on it. He showed some graphics of the canyon from Google Earth.

Bodega Canyon is about 1/3 the size of Monterey Canyon. Monterey canyon is an active canyon, with sand entering it, and gravity flow and turbidity currently helping form its shape. It has an inactive arm, Soquel Canyon. He explained projects to map and model Monterey Canyon turbidity currents and determine their effects; sediment, rocks and monitoring equipment moved significant distances during the experiments.

Some features of Bodega Canyon are its depth, 150 – 1300 m; and a large knick point with a steep slope, unique among California system canyons. Bodega Canyon is likely to have a largely smooth floor with finely grained accumulated sediment that accumulated slowly over time, typical of inactive canyons. Its origin was probably channeling sediment during the first ice ages, and movement of sediment through turbidity currents. Nearby to the north is a large slump, larger than the Tubeworm Slump in Monterey Canyon; and nearby to the south is a box canyon.

If he had a grant to study Bodega Canyon, Charlie said he would start with getting a more detailed morphology. He would survey patches to determine what was in the landscape. If the scars are young, there may be big beds of chemosynthetic communities. Because of the deep canyon head, he did not think Bodega Canyon was affecting surface fertility.

### **Advisory Council Business Cont. (Lilli)**

Possible 2015 meeting dates were reviewed, and tentative dates that would work for the majority were selected. Lilli said she would email the final list of dates and locations to the group.

### **Public Comment**

Michael Hanrahan, website specialist with The Marine Mammal Center, thanked Rachel Bergren for inviting him to attend. He looked forward to learning how the expansion went, and commented he was always looking for relevant stories for their website.

### **Members' and Alternates' Reports (Advisory Council)**

Jaime reviewed the recent die-off of Cassin's auklets and collections made from various locations. The chicks probably didn't know where to find food. He noted a spike this big had never been recorded. For Whale Alert, 200 packets were mailed to whale watching outlets, and calls were made asking them to participate. Thanks to John Berge, packets were also sent to Seattle and Long Beach for distribution to shipping agencies. CalAcademy will soon have a new exhibit on local whale conservation. Jaime provided ACCESS and Whale Alert information to the exhibit organizers.

George said he recently trained as a Beach Watch volunteer, for Abbotts Lagoon to North Beach.

Dayna reviewed that, up to 4-5 years ago, he was the NOAA National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS) contact for all West Coast sanctuaries. Due to budget and travel ceilings, that was discontinued, though he continued to go to Olympic Coast National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council meetings. Two NMFS divisions merged last June, with some leadership changes. There was an increase in budget, and he can participate again. His goal is to attend at least a couple of advisory council meetings per sanctuary per year. He will also do trainings for boarding officers in Alameda. He mentioned he would meet with Michael to talk about reinvigorating the Technical Advisory Committee for Enforcement. He plans to report on enforcement at advisory council meetings. Once a new law enforcement person is hired, that person would become his alternate to the CBNMS Advisory Council; Joe will be moving to a supervisory position.

John mentioned he sent an article about the radiation from the 2011 Japan nuclear power plant accident to Dan, asking that he send it on to folks who needed the information. He said researchers found cesium 134 about 150 miles south of Eureka, travelling as a plume largely driven by oceanic currents. The levels are 10 million times less than those detected off the nuclear power plant during the incident. Cesium 137 has been detected in the Pacific, from 1950s nuclear testing, at levels 1000 times lower than the EPA standard for drinking water.

Rachel reported the staff of The Marine Mammal Center was working to learn more about the endangered Hawaiian monk seal, and said they recently treated two patients at their Hawaii facility. She listed some of the factors that affect their population. Here, the staff is gearing up for the busy season, which coincides with breeding and pupping for elephant and harbor seals in February/March, and also when California sea lions start pupping in June/July. Rescue numbers are up, with 900 rescues so far in 2014; about 2/3 of those animals were released. The center's range extends down to Santa Barbara County now. The Center does an annual year in review, and that Rachel said would be happy to forward the date to the group; the next one is in January.

Amanda said she is the Living Marine Resources Officer for Sector San Francisco and is the patrol boat manager. Her last post was in North Carolina. There were three national marine sanctuaries violations that the Coast Guard brought up to NOAA recently; two of them were jet

ski violations in GFNMS, and the other, she believed in CBNMS, involved human waste discharge.

Sarah reported that Surfrider had done some creek restoration to benefit salmon. Separately, regarding University of California, Davis (UCD) activities, she said UCD has a new Coastal and Marine Sciences Institute. Talks are in process about the exact organizational goals and mission and what Bodega Marine Laboratory (BML) researchers will do. Some BML post-docs have put some “pod” information on the website focusing on marine science issues and questions, with much of it coming from the National Science Foundation-funded Coastal, Atmospheric, and Marine Environmental Observing Studies (CAMEOS) program. She also said there was a new BML speaker series at a wine bar periodically on Tuesdays in Bodega Bay. She said she would be happy to connect Michael with the planners for potentially scheduling a whale alert talk.

Leslie Adler-Ivanbrook reported the program she works on has reached 500 students and 100 teachers so far in 2014. She has increased ocean health messages in the chapter on education, including information about CBNMS and GFNMS, marine debris surveys and the Long-term Monitoring Program and Experiential Training for Students (LiMPETS). This winter, Leslie mentioned will work on a climate change program for Science on a Sphere. She also announced a Point Reyes National Seashore bird count event is planned for January.

Kevin Krick mentioned he was on the board of the North American Marine Environment Protection Association, which was started seven years ago. The group educates people in the marine industry as well as the general public. A West Coast director has been hired, and if the advisory council was interested, he said she could give a talk about outreach at an upcoming meeting. People indicated they were interested.

Pete said it was his last advisory council meeting [prior to his term ending]. He said he enjoyed working with people, and hoped he had made a good contribution. He mentioned he was thinking of volunteering with the Cordell Marine Sanctuary Foundation. Everyone applauded his service to the advisory council.

George adjourned the meeting at 2:03 PM.